

Evan Roberts, Jacqueline Cumming, Katherine Nelson, "A Review of Economic Evaluations of Community Mental Health Care," Medical Care Research and Review.

Supplementary Tables.

Permanent internet location: [http://www.pop.umn.edu/~eroberts/mcrr\\_cmhc\\_evaluations.pdf](http://www.pop.umn.edu/~eroberts/mcrr_cmhc_evaluations.pdf)

Table 2. Characteristics and outcomes of the evaluations

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Assertive Community Treatment (ACT) programs	Fenton	(Fenton, Tessier, and Struening 1979; Fenton et al. 1982; Fenton et al. 1984)	1. Home care (76) 2. Hospital care at Montreal General Hospital (79)	Psychiatric Evaluation Form	Home care > Hospital care	Home care < Hospital care
	Weisbrod	(Weisbrod, Stein, and Test 1980; Weisbrod 1981; Weisbrod 1983; Test and Stein 1980; Stein and Test 1980)	1. ACT (65) 2. Standard hospital treatment at Mendota Mental Health Institute (65)	Community Adjustment Form Rosenburg Self-Esteem Scale Short Clinical Rating Scale	ACT > Hospital treatment (p < 0.05 on 7/13 measures of 'clinical symptomatology, ACT significantly greater on patient satisfaction with life)	ACT < Hospital treatment
	Hoult	(Hoult et al. 1983; Hoult, Rosen, and Reynolds 1984; Hoult 1986; Hoult et al. 1981)	1. Community treatment modelled on Madison trial (53) 2. Standard hospital care (47)	BPRS Health and Sickness Rating Scale PSE	Community treatment > Standard hospital care (statistically significant difference in outcomes at 12 months)	Community treatment < Standard hospital care
	Jerrell and Hu	(Jerrell and Hu 1989)	1. Intensive clinical and case management modelled on ACT 2. 'Existing system of care' (Total n=35. Sample size in each intervention not stated)	BPRS Quality of Life Scale RFS SAS	Existing system of care > Intensive clinical and case management	Intensive clinical and case management > Existing system of care

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
ACT	Chandler	(Chandler, Meisel, Hu et al. 1996; Chandler, Meisel, McGowen et al. 1996; Chandler, Hu et al. 1997; Chandler, Meisel et al. 1997; Hu and Jerrell 1991)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Integrated Service Agencies modelled on ACT (210)</li> <li>2. 'Usual' clinical mental health services provided by county (202)</li> </ol>	<p>Colorado Symptom Index</p> <p>LQL Instrument</p> <p>New York Self-Esteem Scale</p>	Integrated Service Agencies > Usual services	Integrated Service Agencies > Usual services
	Knapp	(Knapp, Beecham, Koutsogeorgopoulou et al. 1994; Knapp, Marks et al. 1998; Marks et al. 1994; Muijen et al. 1992; Audini et al. 1994)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Daily Living Program (92)</li> <li>2. Standard hospital care (97)</li> </ol>	<p>BPRS</p> <p>GAS</p> <p>PSE</p> <p>SAS</p>	Daily Living Program > Standard hospital care	Daily Living Program < Standard hospital care
	Hu and Jerrell	(Hu and Jerrell 1998; Jerrell 1995)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Intensive broker model (42)</li> <li>2. Clinical team (40)</li> <li>3. PACT adaptation (40)</li> </ol>	<p>RFS</p> <p>SAS (version II)</p> <p>Satisfaction with Life Scale</p>	Intensive broker > PACT adaptation > Clinical team (reduction in total psychiatric symptoms)	Intensive broker > Clinical team > PACT adaptation

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
ACT	Rosenheck	(Rosenheck et al. 1995; Rosenheck and Neale 1998)	1. Intensive Psychiatric Community Care modelled on ACT (454) Standard Veterans' Administration care (419) at General Medical and Surgical (GMS), and Neuropsychiatric sites	Addiction Severity Index BPRS Brief Symptom Inventory GAS	IPCC > Standard care at GMS sites IPCC < standard care at neuropsychiatric sites (change in BPRS)	IPCC > Standard care at GMS sites IPCC < Standard care at neuropsychiatric sites
	Wolff	(Wolff et al. 1997; Morse et al. 1997)	1. ACT (28) 2. ACT with community workers (35) 3. Broker case management (22)	BPRS	ACT with community workers > Assertive community treatment > Broker case management (BPRS total symptom score)	ACT > Broker case management > ACT with community workers
	McCrone	(McCrone, Thornicroft, Phelan et al. 1998; Wykes et al. 1998)	1. Intensive sector (62) 2. Standard sector (61) Both implementations of ACT	BPRS GAF Schedules for Clinical Assessment in Neuropsychiatry Social Behaviour Schedule	Standard sector > Intensive sector	Intensive sector > Standard sector
	Essock	(Essock and Kontos 1995; Essock, Frisman, and Kontos 1998)	1. ACT 2. Standard case management (Total n=262)	Client Outcome Scale LQL Scale Symptom Check List	ACT > Standard case management	ACT < Standard case management
ACT	Lehman	(Dixon et al. 1995; Lehman et al. 1997; Lehman et al. 1999)	1. ACT (77) 2. 'Usual' community care (75)	LQL Interview MOS SF-36 Structured Clinical Interview for DSM-III-R	ACT = Usual community care	ACT < Usual community care

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Case Management	Franklin	(Franklin et al. 1987)	1. Case management (213) 2. 'Usual and customary' services of community mental health centre (204)	Activities of Daily Living Psychological Well-being Self Esteem scales	Case management > Usual and customary services (change in ADL, SE and PWB)	Case management > Usual and customary services
	Bond	(Bond et al. 1988)	1. Assertive case management (84) 2. Usual public mental health services (83)	Hospitalisation	Assertive case management > Control	Control > Assertive case management
	McGurrin	(McGurrin and Worley 1993)	1. Intensive case management (113) 2. Control group receiving standard services (70)	BPRS GAF	Intensive case management > Control group (inpatient hospitalisation)	Control group > Intensive case management
Case Management	Quinlivan	(Quinlivan et al. 1995)	1. Intensive case management (30) 2. Traditional case management (30) 3. Control group receiving 'no particular services' (30)	Hospitalisation	Intensive case management > Traditional case management > Control group	Control group > Traditional case management > Intensive case management
	Ford	(Ford, Ryan et al. 1997; Ford, Raftery et al. 1997)	1. Intensive case management (39) 2. 'Existing services' (38)	BPRS Life Skills Profile	Intensive case management = Existing services (both measures were non-significantly different, and showed opposite orientation of results)	Intensive case management > Existing services
	Clark	(Clark et al. 1998; Drake et al. 1998)	1. Standard case management (93) 2. ACT (100)	LQL Scale Substance Abuse Treatment Scale	ACT > Standard case management (non-statistically significant greater improvement in SATS and QOL)	ACT < Standard case management

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
	Johnston	(Johnston et al. 1998)	1. Intensive case management (37) 2. Routine case management (36)	Life Skills Profile	Intensive > Routine (number improving on LSP)	Intensive > Routine
	Chan	(Chan, Mackenzie, and Jacobs 2000)	1. Case Management (31) 2. Routine community care (31)	BPRS Specific Level of Functioning Scale Patient Satisfaction Instrument	Intensive case management > routine community care	Intensive case management > routine community care
Case Management	UK700 Group	(Burns et al. 1999; Byford et al. 2001; Hassiotis et al. 2001; UK700 Group 1999, 2000)	1. Intensive case management (335) 2. Standard case management (332)	Comprehensive Psychopathological Rating Scale Montgomery-Åsberg Depression Rating Scale Lancashire Quality of Life Profile Camberwell Assessment of Need	Intensive case management = standard case management	Intensive case management = standard case management
	Rosenheck II	(Rosenheck et al. 2003)	1. HUD-VA supported housing with intensive case management (182) 2. Case management only (90) 3. Standard VA care (188)	Addiction Severity Index Brief Symptom Index LQL Days housed	HUD-VA > case management > standard care	HUD-VA > case management > standard care
	Jones	(Jones et al. 2003)	1. Critical time intervention and case management 2. "Usual services"	Days housed	Critical time > usual services	Critical time > usual services

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Community Psychiatric Nurses (CPN)	Mangen	(Mangen et al. 1983; Paykel et al. 1982)	1. CPN visiting patients in the home (36) 2. Psychiatric outpatient care (35)	Clinical Interview for Depression SAS	CPN = Psychiatric outpatient care (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	CPN > Psychiatric outpatient care
CPN	Gournay	(Gournay and Brooking 1995; Gournay and Brooking 1994)	1. CPN (49) 2. General practitioner treatment (46)	Beck Depression Inventory General Health Questionnaire Life Disruption Rating Spielberger State Trait Anxiety Inventory Standardised Psychiatric Interview	CPN = General practitioner treatment (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	CPN < General practitioner treatment
	McCrone II	(McCrone, Beecham, and Knapp 1994; Muijen et al. 1994)	1. Intensive support CPN teams (41) 2. Generic CPN working independently (41)	BPRS Global Adjustment Scale PSE SAS	Intensive CPN = Generic CPN (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	Intensive CPN < Generic CPN
Other Services	Dickey	(Dickey, Cannon et al. 1986)	1. Quarterway House residential program (13) 2. Inpatient care (9)	Quantified Psychiatric Mental Status Scale GAS Checklist of Antisocial and Socialization Behaviors	Quarterway House = Inpatient care (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	Quarterway House < Inpatient care

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Other Services	Burns	(Burns, Raftery et al. 1993; Burns, Beadsmoore et al. 1993; Burns and Raftery 1991)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Home based outreach services (94)</li> <li>2. 'Standard' outpatient psychiatric care (78)</li> </ol>	BPRS PSE Social Functioning Schedule	Home based outreach = Standard outpatient care (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	Home based outreach services < Standard outpatient care
	Merson	(Merson et al. 1996; Merson et al. 1992)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Multidisciplinary community based team (48)</li> <li>2. 'Conventional' hospital based psychiatric services (52)</li> </ol>	Brief Scale for Anxiety Comprehensive Psychopathological Rating Scale MADRS Social Functioning Questionnaire	Community based team > Hospital based services	Community based teams < Hospital based services
	Babigian	(Babigian and Marshall 1989; Babigian et al. 1991; Cole et al. 1994; Reed et al. 1994)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Capitated community care (279)</li> <li>2. Fee-for-service community care (143)</li> </ol>	BPRS GAS Scale for Assessment of Negative Symptoms	Capitated care > Fee-for-service care	Capitated care < Fee-for-service care
	Wiersma	(Wiersma et al. 1995)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Day treatment with community care (70)</li> <li>2. In-patient psychiatric treatment (33)</li> </ol>	Groningen Social Disabilities Schedule PSE	Not stated : analysis of diagnostic not treatment groups	Not stated : analysis of diagnostic not treatment groups

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Other Services	Beecham	(Beecham et al. 1996; Donnelly et al. 1996)	1. Long-stay psychiatric hospital 2. Community care pre-post study with 133 patients	Personal Presentation Checklist Problems Questionnaire Residents Interview Social Functioning Questionnaire	Community care = Long-stay psychiatric hospital	Community care < Long-stay psychiatric hospital
	Goldberg	(Goldberg et al. 1996)	1. Primary care based CMHC team (108) 2. Hospital-based psychiatric service (57)	Psychiatric Assessment Schedule Social Assessment Schedule Social Problems Questionnaire	Community based team = Hospital based service	Community based team < Hospital based service
	Sledge	(Sledge, Tebes, Rakfeldt et al. 1996; Sledge, Tebes, Woolf et al. 1996)	1. Day hospital care (93) 2. Inpatient care (104)	BPRS Connecticut Department of Mental Health Quality of Life Survey GAS Quality of Life interview (modified) SAS - Self Report Structured Clinical Interview for DSM-III-R	Day hospital care = Inpatient care	Day hospital care < Inpatient care

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Other Services	Creed	(Creed et al. 1997; Holme, Creed, and Tomenson 1997)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Day hospital care (94)</li> <li>2. Inpatient care (93)</li> </ol>	Comprehensive Psychopathological Rating Scale PSE Social Behaviour Assessment Schedule Social Behaviour Schedule	Day hospital care = Inpatient care	Day hospital care < Inpatient care

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Other Services	van Minnen	(van Minnen, Hoogduin, and Broekman 1997)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Outreach treatment (25)</li> <li>2. Hospital treatment (25)</li> </ol>	Global Rating Scale for Improvement Psychopathology Inventory for Mentally Retarded Adults Reiss Screen for Maladaptive Behavior Scale for Aggressive Behavior for People with Mental Retardation Social Competence Scale for People with Mild Mental Retardation	Outreach treatment = Hospital treatment (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	Outreach treatment < Hospital treatment
	Tyrer	(Tyrer et al. 1998)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Community multidisciplinary teams (74)</li> <li>2. Hospital based services (70)</li> </ol>	Brief Anxiety Scale Comprehensive Psychopathological Rating Scale GAF Hospital anxiety and depression scale MADRS Social functioning questionnaire	Community multidisciplinary teams = Hospital based services (non-statistically significant differences of opposite signs on different measures)	Community multidisciplinary teams < Hospital based services

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Other Services	Boardman	(Boardman et al. 1999; Haycox et al. 1999)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Community mental health centres with attached in-patient units (110)</li> <li>2. Community mental health centres without units (67)</li> </ol>	PSE GAF Hamilton Rating Scale for Depression Health of the Nation Outcome Scales Camberwell Assessment of Need Lancashire Quality of Life Profile Social Behaviour Schedule	Centres with attached in-patient units > Centres without units (greater improvement on outcome measures)	Centres with attached in-patient units > Centres without units
	Lesage	(Lesage et al. 2000; Reinharz, Lesage, and Contandriopoulos 2000)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Discharged psychiatric hospital patients (96)</li> <li>2. Non-discharged psychiatric hospital patients (96)</li> </ol>	Independent Living Skills Schedule Levels of Care Survey Needs for Care Assessment Schedule	Discharged > non-discharged	Discharged < non-discharged
	Mihalopoulos	(Mihalopoulos, McGorry, and Carter 1999)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Early Psychosis Prevention and Intervention Centre (51)</li> <li>2. Pre- EPPIC services (51)</li> </ol>	Quality of Life Survey Scale for the Assessment of Negative Symptoms	EPPIC > pre-EPPIC	EPPIC < pre-EPPIC

Type of program	Short reference	References	Interventions compared (sample size)	Outcome measures	Effectiveness	Resource Use
Other Services	Clarkson	(Clarkson et al. 1999)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Community mental health with support workers (37)</li> <li>2. Community mental health without support workers (39)</li> </ol>	Camberwell Assessment of Need Lancashire Quality of Life Profile Verona Service Satisfaction Schedule Social Network Schedule GAF	With support workers > without support workers	With support workers < without support workers
	Lin	(Lin et al. 2001)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Hospital based home care (30)</li> <li>2. "Traditional" community care (30)</li> </ol>	Community Psychiatric Rating Scale Social Functioning Rating Scale	Hospital based > community care	Hospital based < community care

BPRS: Brief Psychiatric Rating Scale. GAF: Global Assessment of Functioning. GAS: Global Assessment Scale. LQL: Lehman Quality of Life MADRS: Montgomery and Åsberg depression rating scale. PSE: Present State Examination. RFS: Role Functioning Scale. SAS: Social Adjustment Scale.

Table 3. Descriptive information

Type of program	Short Reference	Country research was conducted in	Years study conducted in	Months of cost data collected
Assertive Community Treatment (ACT)	Fenton	Canada	1973-	24
	Weisbrod	United States	1972-	12
	Hoult	Australia	1979-1981	12
	Jerrell and Hu	United States	1986-1988	24
	Chandler	United States	1990-1993	36
	Knapp	United Kingdom	1987-1993	45
	Hu and Jerrell	United States	not stated	18
	Rosenheck	United States	1987-1992	24
	Wolff	United States	not stated	18
	McCrone	United Kingdom	1992-1996	6
	Essock	United States	1989-1993	18
	Lehman	United States	1991-1993	12
Case Management	Franklin	United States	1981-1982	12
	Bond	United States	1986	6
	McGurrin	United States	not stated	36
	Quinlivan	United States	not stated	24
	Ford	United Kingdom	not stated	18
	Clark	United States	1989-1995	36
	Johnston	Australia	1994-1995	12
	Chan	Hong Kong	1997-1998	5
	UK700	United Kingdom	1994-1997	24
	Rosenheck II	United States	1992-1998	36
	Jones	United States	1991-1995	18

Type of program	Short Reference	Country research was conducted in	Years study conducted in	Months of cost data collected
Community Psychiatric Nurses (CPN)	Mangen	United Kingdom	not stated	18
	Gournay	United Kingdom	1988-1991	6
	McCrone II	United Kingdom	1989-1990	18
Other Services	Dickey	United States	1979-1981	24
	Burns	United Kingdom	1987-1989	12
	Babigian	United States	1987-1992	24
	Merson	United Kingdom	1989-1990	3
	Wiersma	Netherlands	1986-1990	24
	Beecham	United Kingdom	1987-1992	24
	Goldberg	United Kingdom	not stated	6
	Sledge	United States	1993	10
	Creed	United Kingdom	not stated	12
	Van Minnen	Netherlands	not stated	6
	Tyrer	United Kingdom	1993	12
	Boardman	United Kingdom	1994-1995	12
	Lesage	Canada	1989-1998	101
	Mihalopoulos	Australia	1993-1994	12
	Clarkson	United Kingdom	not stated	12
Lin	Taiwan	1999	12	

